ACROSS-THE BOARD-MOVEMENT

is actually asymmetrical

Symmetrical Accounts

Noted Asymmetries

Reconstruction:

Principle A
1) *What picture of herself did James sell and Susan buy?
2) What picture of himself did James sell and Susan buy? (Munn, 1993)

Principle C
3) *(Which picture of John) did he, like and Mary dislike?
4) *(Which picture of John) did Mary like and he, dislike? (Cikok, 2003)

Weak crossover:

5) *Who, should his best friend invite and Ivy meet?
6) Who should Ivy meet and his best friend invite? (Munn, 1993)

Form mismatch:

7) Ein Buch (weergaren/verweergaren) wüste Maria nie aber hat Hans schon oft a book throw away/throwen away] would Maria never but has Hans already often
8) Ein Buch (weergaren/verweergaren) hat. Hans schon oft aber wüste Maria nie a book throw away/throwen away has Hans already often but would Maria never
9) *Throw a book, Hans often but has Maria never would (Salzmann, 2012)

ATB and islands

No island effects:

Bachrach and Kato 2009 claim that ATB extraction is not always subject to islands: 0) *Which book did John meet the man who wrote and Mary meet the man who published?
1) The same person, Bill lost business because he hired and Mary praised a lot.
2) *Which picture of herself did James sell and Susan buy?
3) Which of the picture to John did Mary like and he, dislike?

Island effects in only the first conjunct:

Zhang 2009 claims that ATB island effects hold only in the first conjunct: 10) The same person, Bill praised a lot and Mary lost business because she hired.
11) *The same person, Bill lost business because he hired and Mary praised a lot.

Island effects in both conjuncts:

Bachrach and Kato 2009 claim that ATB extraction is sometimes subject to island effects in both conjuncts (this is also the null hypothesis): 12) *Who did [a man who loves __ dance], and [a woman who hates __ go home]?
Further, Cikok notes that strong crossover effects arise in both conjunct: 13) *Who is [lord who lives __ dance], and [a woman who hates __ go home]?
14) *Who is [lord who lives __ dance], and [the, never visit __]?

Asymmetrical Accounts

Questions

The previous asymmetries concern issues of reconstruction and not movement per se. Might they nevertheless implicate the choice between the symmetrical account and the asymmetrical one?

What is the case with islands? Do they show an asymmetric pattern or a symmetric one? Which of the approaches to islands in ATB constructions most closely resembles speakers’ judgments?

Materials

ATB and islands

No island effects:

Bachrach and Kato 2009 claim that ATB extraction is not always subject to islands: 0) *Which book did John meet the man who wrote and Mary meet the man who published?
1) The same person, Bill lost business because he hired and Mary praised a lot.
2) *Which picture of herself did James sell and Susan buy?
3) Which of the picture to John did Mary like and he, dislike?

Island effects in only the first conjunct:

Zhang 2009 claims that ATB island effects hold only in the first conjunct: 10) The same person, Bill praised a lot and Mary lost business because she hired.
11) *The same person, Bill lost business because he hired and Mary praised a lot.

Island effects in both conjuncts:

Bachrach and Kato 2009 claim that ATB extraction is sometimes subject to island effects in both conjuncts (this is also the null hypothesis): 12) *Who did [a man who loves __ dance], and [a woman who hates __ go home]?
Further, Cikok notes that strong crossover effects arise in both conjunct: 13) *Who is [lord who lives __ dance], and [a woman who hates __ go home]?
14) *Who is [lord who lives __ dance], and [the, never visit __]?

Asymmetrical Accounts

Noted Asymmetries

Reconstruction:

Principle A
1) *Which picture of herself did James sell and Susan buy?
2) What picture of himself did James sell and Susan buy? (Munn, 1993)

Principle C
3) *(Which picture of John) did he, like and Mary dislike?
4) *(Which picture of John) did Mary like and he, dislike? (Cikok, 2003)

Weak crossover:

5) *Who, should his best friend invite and Ivy meet?
6) Who should Ivy meet and his best friend invite? (Munn, 1993)

Form mismatch:

7) Ein Buch (weergaren/verweergaren) wüste Maria nie aber hat Hans schon oft a book throw away/throwen away] would Maria never but has Hans already often
8) Ein Buch (weergaren/verweergaren) hat. Hans schon oft aber wüste Maria nie a book throw away/throwen away has Hans already often but would Maria never
9) *Throw a book, Hans often but has Maria never would (Salzmann, 2012)

ATB and islands

No island effects:

Bachrach and Kato 2009 claim that ATB extraction is not always subject to islands: 0) *Which book did John meet the man who wrote and Mary meet the man who published?
1) The same person, Bill lost business because he hired and Mary praised a lot.
2) *Which picture of herself did James sell and Susan buy?
3) Which of the picture to John did Mary like and he, dislike?

Island effects in only the first conjunct:

Zhang 2009 claims that ATB island effects hold only in the first conjunct: 10) The same person, Bill praised a lot and Mary lost business because she hired.
11) *The same person, Bill lost business because he hired and Mary praised a lot.

Island effects in both conjuncts:

Bachrach and Kato 2009 claim that ATB extraction is sometimes subject to island effects in both conjuncts (this is also the null hypothesis): 12) *Who did [a man who loves __ dance], and [a woman who hates __ go home]?
Further, Cikok notes that strong crossover effects arise in both conjunct: 13) *Who is [lord who lives __ dance], and [a woman who hates __ go home]?
14) *Who is [lord who lives __ dance], and [the, never visit __]?

Asymmetrical Accounts

Noted Asymmetries

Reconstruction:

Principle A
1) *Which picture of herself did James sell and Susan buy?
2) What picture of himself did James sell and Susan buy? (Munn, 1993)

Principle C
3) *(Which picture of John) did he, like and Mary dislike?
4) *(Which picture of John) did Mary like and he, dislike? (Cikok, 2003)

Weak crossover:

5) *Who, should his best friend invite and Ivy meet?
6) Who should Ivy meet and his best friend invite? (Munn, 1993)

Form mismatch:

7) Ein Buch (weergaren/verweergaren) wüste Maria nie aber hat Hans schon oft a book throw away/throwen away] would Maria never but has Hans already often
8) Ein Buch (weergaren/verweergaren) hat. Hans schon oft aber wüste Maria nie a book throw away/throwen away has Hans already often but would Maria never
9) *Throw a book, Hans often but has Maria never would (Salzmann, 2012)