Antecedent Contained Deletion:
A Minimalist Perspective
Howard Lasnik
University of Connecticut

(1) John read everything Bill did
(2) John [vp read everything Bill did [vp e]]
(3) [everything [OP Bill did [vp e]]] [John [vp read [x]]]

(4) Dulles suspected everyone who Angleton did
(5) *Dulles suspected Philby, who Angleton did
(6) *Dulles suspected Philby, who Angleton did too
(7) ?Dulles suspected Philby, who Angleton didn't

(9) S
  NP
  John
  VP
  read everything Bill did [x]

(10) (*) I believed everyone that you did to be polite
(11) I visited a man [that] John mentioned recently
(12) ?I visited a man [that] John mentioned recently
(13) *I believed (that) every one you did was polite
(14) Someone believes everyone to be a genius
(15) Someone believes (that) everyone is a genius
(16) What did everyone buy for Max
(17) What do you think everyone bought for Max
(18) Who read everything Bill did

(19) [CP who [IP [x] [OP [NP everything Bill did [vp e]]] [vp read [x]]]]
I spoke to Bill, who you did too.

Mary talked about Harry, who John did too.

She stood near Tommy, who you did too.

Dulles suspected everyone Angleton did.

Dulles suspected everyone Angleton said Philby did.

*She stood near Tommy, who you did too.

Dulles suspected everyone Angleton wondered why Philby did.

Who did Angleton say Philby suspected?

Who did Angleton wonder why Philby suspected?

*Dulles suspected everyone that Angleton believed the claim that Philby did.

*Who did Angleton believe the claim that Philby suspected?

*Who did Angleton suspect Angleton believed everyone that Angleton believed the claim that Philby did?

*What do you wonder [who]

Why do you wonder [whether]

What do you think that Mary read?

*Who do you think that read the book

*Why do you think that Mary read the book

*What do you think that Mary read the book

*What do you think that Mary read the book

Hypothesis: 'Uniform' chains are well-formed, so, by (54), trace deletion is not permitted. (Operator-(argument)variable pairs constitute well-formed objects, so any intermediate traces must, hence may, be deleted.

Subjacency is therefore a constraint on Move a, and not (solely) a filter on LF representations. The intermediate traces of wh-movement of an argument must be deleted, thus obliterating the representational difference between normal successive-cyclic movement and movement out of an island.

Configurations of ACD must involve movement of the relative operator. Further, if Subjacency is strictly a constraint on movement in the overt syntax, and not on LF movement, then these configurations must involve overt movement (and subsequent deletion). (Ross (1970) presents virtually the same argument to the effect that Sluicing must involve movement and deletion.)

What forces overt movement?

(a) An operator cannot be base-generated in Comp.

(b) A null operator is invisible for LF movement.

Deletion (or copying) under identity to what?

I turned in my assignment, but most of the other students didn't [turn in their assignments]

Cheryl stops to look at any pretty flower she stumbles onto, and I do too

Mary loves John, and John/he thinks that Sally does [love him] too

John kissed every girl who wanted him too

'Vehicle Change': a [-pronominal] counts as identical to its [+pronominal] correlate. (Fiengo and May, as cited in Wyngaerd and Zwart)

Hypothesis: consider VC as an in principle unlimited phenomenon. (Wyngaerd and Zwart)

In, e.g., (1), [read everything Bill did [vpe]] is, under VC, equivalent to [read [x]].

a John kissed Mary, but I wonder who Harry did [e]

b John loves himself, but I wonder who Harry does

c John was killed by Mary, but I wonder who Sally did
'Moderately strong' VC: Fiengo and May, plus count an operator as equivalent to a coindexed variable.

Who thought that Fred read how many of the books that Bill did (that Bill read/ *that Bill thought Fred read)

Which student thinks that Bill visited which city that you did

Which student thinks that Bill visited which city that you do

Which student wants to visit which city that you do

Which student wants to visit which city that you do

Which student thinks that Bill visited which city that you do

John wants to visit every city that you do

I wanted to visit yesterday someone who I really liked

Mary wonders which pictures of herself John will like

Mary thinks that John will like every picture of herself

Mary thinks that [every picture of herself] [John will like it]

Mary wonders which man will like which pictures of herself

The DA proved the [defendants to be guilty] during each other's trials